

NOMCOM Chairperson's Report 2016

Candidate Review

In all, the NOMCOM received 39 unique candidates from 22 countries, spread across the regions with 6 from Africa, 8 from Asia-Pacific, 1 from Eastern Europe, 7 from Europe, 5 from Latin & South America, 0 from the Middle East and 12 from North America. 29 candidates were male and 10 female. None declared a disability. An additional phenomenon this year was that of candidates (3) being nominated multiple times (19, 4 and 2), meaning all up 61 nominations were received.

Table 1 Demographics of nominees

Demographic	2016	%	2015	%
Countries	22	100%	20	100%
Male	29	74%	19	76%
Female	10	26%	6	24%
Regions				
North America	12	31%	5	20%
Asia-Pacific	8	21%	4	16%
EU	7	18%	5	20%
African	6	15%	6	24%
LAC	5	13%	3	12%
East Europe	1	3%	0	0%
MENA	0	0%	2	8%
TOTAL	39	100%	25	100%

The candidates were reviewed independently by NOMCOM members and rated according to their suitability to serve as determined by the board criteria:

Candidates for ISOC Trustee will have demonstrable involvement in the Internet with deep understanding in at least two of the following areas:

- *Internet standards*
- *Internet operations*
- *Public policy for Internet and telecommunications*
- *Internet development*

Ideal candidates will also have a good understanding of broader technology, policy, business and/or economic issues relevant to the Society.

The following qualifications are also highly desirable:

- *Previous board or leadership experience, especially for not-for-profit entities;*
- *Skills in organizational management, leadership and governance;*
- *Sound financial acumen;*
- *Financial oversight and fund raising;*
- *The ability to identify relevant ISOC projects and attendant community engagement models;*
- *Vision for the role of the Internet Society;*
- *Good understanding of the functioning of the Internet and the associated technologies;*
- *Demonstrated abilities as a long-term, strategic thinker;*
- *High ethical standards and integrity;*
- *Well developed collaboration and consensus-building skills;*
- *Strong communication skills;*
- *Will bring passion and energy to the role.*

The ISOC Board of Trustees aims to be as broadly representative of the many cultures and communities around the world that it can. While all qualified candidates are welcome, we strongly encourage members from currently under-represented areas to nominate candidates. In this light, nominations of candidates from Central and South America; younger candidates; women and those with the lived experience of disability are encouraged.

All Trustees must be able to read and understand a balance sheet, as well as read and communicate effectively in the English language. Gender balance, geographic, cultural, and other forms of diversity are also key considerations. In addition, any potential conflicts of interest that may exclude some nominees will be explored.

Prior to the discussion members of the NOMCOM rated each candidate indicating whether the candidate should be interviewed, or whether the candidate was on paper of merit for serious consideration. Not every member of the NOMCOM recorded their ranking so that table is not reproduced here. The NOMCOM met on 7 January 2015 at UTC 11:00 and reviewed all the candidates considering the attributes presented on their submissions.

Further considerations are outlined in the guidance to the NOMCOM from the Board Governance Committee 2015. The NOMCOM also determined that a period of time should elapse between employment with the organisation and standing for as a Trustee. One election cycle was considered sufficient.

Candidate Discussion

Of the thirty-nine candidates, 11 candidates were interviewed and a further four were discussed for shortlisting should the first group be considered insufficient. All highly ranked candidates were interviewed with a standard set of questions, with the opportunity for both the candidate and the NOMCOM as a whole to ask additional questions. A balance of candidates for the available positions (two organizational and one chapter) was compiled.

The NOMCOM held a meeting by teleconference at 11:00 UTC 12 February to compile a final slate, subject to reference checking. After reviewing the various qualities and experience of the candidates, and in an attempt to gain good geographic and attribute diversity, the following was recommended as a slate.

On that basis, the NOMCOM's recommended slate was:

Table 2 Final Slate

Candidate	Family Name	Country of Residence	Seat
Olga	Cavalli	Argentina	Chapters
Mohamed	El Bashir	Sudan	Chapters
Andrey	Kolesnikov	Russia	Chapters
John	Laprise	USA	Orgs
Desiree	Miloshevic	UK	Orgs
Harish	Pillay	Singapore	Orgs

Petitions

Unlike previous years, the petition process was used. Essentially a valid petition required an email from at least 8 chapter voting representatives (for a chapter candidacy) or 9 organizational member voting representatives (for an organizational member candidacy). This meant that the documentation to support the process was hurriedly reviewed, and ultimately the process was tested. Some hiccoughs were experienced in this process:

- The petitions period was extended slightly due to the delay in notifications going to the chapters list.
- The number of signatures required for a successful petition was dependent on the number of eligible voters and this number had not been locked down for the election.
- The overall petitions period may not be sufficiently long for communications and deliberations to be made by voting organisations, especially if a petition is mounted late in the process.

- Petitions are only receivable by email and require separate human validation (a web form with a confirmation automatically sent to the valid voting address, cc the NOMCOM chair would be better).
- Petitioners may request a petition during non ISOC business hours.

The petitioner mounted a petition at Saturday, 5 March 2016 at 15:59 UTC which was technically 27 hours after the end of the original petition period was due to expire. One valid signature was received before the closing time of 7 March at 15:00 and one shortly thereafter. Another chapter representative indicated on the ISOC Skype chat that it was keen for an extension, but this was not directly requested of the NOMCOM Chair in any formal way. Another extension was not granted and the petition was deemed to have failed.

Chairperson's reflections

This year's crop of interviews seemed considerably more focused than in previous years. This may have been because interviewees were asked to review the current business plan and be prepared to answer a question on the strengths and weaknesses of the plan and challenges for implementation. This meant that, unlike previous years, all interviewees actually looked at the web site, and reviewed aspects of the organisation's financials and business. This possibly served to make them consider in a more professional manner what they had nominated for.

More candidates than in previous years demonstrated familiarity with the chapter structure; had attended ISOC events; and had observations to make about ISOC's actual performance in the various forums, not just ICANN or IETF. There also appear to be more qualified candidates coming through, including those from developing nations. Both of these are refreshing signs and indicate that the organisation is having impact.

A number of interviewees demonstrated real passion for not only the organisation's mission, but for the organisation itself.

The phenomenon of multiple nominations indicates that some candidates consider campaigning for election as a necessity. The NOMCOM does not need the additional impost on its time to review multiple nominations for any single candidate: if a single valid nomination is received the NOMCOM will review the candidate fairly and thoroughly. In some segments of the ISOC community this type of campaigning is seen as distasteful, but for others it is seen as both necessary and normal. Third party nominations may also arrive without the candidate being aware.

The question of ex-staff members standing for the board was also considered. Former staff members can be highly capable, strongly performing board members and this is not uncommon in the not-for-profit sector. Ongoing involvement from staff in the Society as alumni should be encouraged as a general principle. A period of time, such as one election cycle, should elapse between a former staff member being eligible to stand, in order to minimise the potential for people to perceive the individual to be acting on the basis of some sort of grievance.

The petition process was challenging to ensure appropriate process was in place especially across time zones and juggling personal commitments in non-business hours.

Staff support was excellent. Kevin Craemer in particular supported the process efficiently and ethically. IT, Chapter and Org-member support were similarly responsive and helpful in the process.

Recommendations

The following recommendations are made:

1. That the Board set the election eligibility cut-off date in future election timetables to occur prior to the opening of the Petitions period.

Rationale: It is necessary to define the number of eligible Chapters and Organizations in order to calculate the number of signatures required in support of petitions for each election.

2. That the Board include separate deadlines for the receipt of petitions, and the receipt of petition signatures in future Election Timetables.

Rationale: Separate deadlines will avoid any confusion on the part of candidates and voters as to deadlines for the receipt of petitions, and the receipt of petition signatures.

3. Reference checking explicit in the advertised process and that the ISOC Executive may also be consulted.

Rationale: Candidates and the NOMCOM must be aware of this necessary process.

4. A note be added to the nominations FAQ to the point that candidates do not need to nominate more than once as the NOMCOM takes every nomination seriously.

Rationale: minimise the workload for NOMCOM and reduce the sense that people need to campaign for inclusion on the election slate.

5. A web form be created for the purpose of lodging and registering petitions, with an automated validation response to the registered voting delegate, cc the NOMCOM Chair.

Rationale: Manual email processes risk the possibility of human error.

Candidate and nominator correspondence

Messages sent to candidates included in the slate:

Date: Sat, Feb 20, 2016 at 12:51 AM

Subject: Congratulations on your inclusion in the Internet Society Chapter Election

Dear Candidate

On behalf of the Nominations Committee, I am pleased to inform you that you have been selected as a candidate to stand in the Chapters election for the Internet Society Board of Trustees. Congratulations!

I will send a message to the Chapters community, shortly, announcing the names of all the candidates. Please refrain from sharing this information until you see this announcement.

Also, please watch your inbox for an email from ISOC Board Liaison Kevin Craemer. He will contact you soon on behalf of the Elections Committee regarding materials needed for your candidate profile on the ISOC website and to provide you with information on the elections and the Candidate Forum.

We look forward to your participation as a candidate. If you have any questions regarding the nomination process, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Best,
Narelle Clark
Chair
ISOC Nominations Committee

Message sent to candidates not included in the slate:

Subject: Your nomination to stand for the ISOC Board - unsuccessful

Dear Candidate

Thank you for your nomination for the ISOC Board of Trustees elections in 2015.

I am sorry to say that on this occasion you were unsuccessful.

Each year, the NOMCOM tries to balance the needs of the organisation to ensure it has the best possible leadership we can. This means we need to people from a range of geographies with a diversity of skills, cultures and backgrounds.

It is also essential that candidates have the necessary Board governance and strategy skills. This means they not only have a vision for the organisation - inclusive of its members - and the technical understanding of the role of a Board given its fiduciary and legal obligations.

All of these skills come together in a balance and we hope you will offer your time and talents to the Society again - whether at the Board level or through the Chapters, Organisational membership and other activities. If there isn't a Chapter in your region, I encourage you to look at starting one. If your organisation is committed to an open, accessible Internet, then please look at joining if your organisation is not an Organisational Member today.

Please rest assured that your candidacy was taken very seriously. The NOMCOM was impressed by both the standard of candidates and the time people are prepared to offer to the Society, and we do not take this offer lightly.

I am happy to discuss this with you further and provide feedback should you wish it.

Once again, thank you for your support in making the Internet for Everyone!

best regards

Narelle

--

Narelle Clark Chair,
Nominations Committee (NOMCOM)
ISOC Board of Trustees
narellec@gmail.com

Message sent to all third party nominees for candidates:

Subject: Outcome of Nomination of <CANDIDATE NAME> to ISOC Board of Trustees - unsuccessful

Dear <NOMINATOR>

Thank you for your nomination of <CANDIDATE> for the ISOC Board of Trustees elections in 2016. I am sorry to say that on this occasion it was unsuccessful.

Each year, the NOMCOM tries to balance the needs of the organisation to ensure it has the best possible leadership we can. This means we need people from a range of geographies with a diversity of skills, cultures and backgrounds.

It is also essential that candidates have the necessary Board governance and strategy skills. This means they not only have a vision for the organisation - inclusive of its members - they also have the technical understanding of the role of a Board given its fiduciary and legal obligations.

All of these skills come together in a balance and we hope to have the offer of time and talent to the Society again - whether at the Board level or through the Chapters, Organisational membership and other activities. If there isn't a Chapter in your region, I encourage you to look at starting one. If your organisation is committed to an open, accessible Internet, then please look at joining if your organisation is not an organisational member today.

Please rest assured that the candidacy was taken very seriously. The NOMCOM was impressed by both the standard of candidates and the time people are prepared to offer to the Society, and we do not take this offer lightly.

I am happy to discuss this with the candidate further and provide feedback should <s/he> wish to and have made the offer to the candidate.

Once again, thank you for your support in making the Internet for Everyone!

best regards

--

Narelle Clark
Chair, Nominations Committee (NOMCOM)
ISOC Board of Trustees
narellec@gmail.com